

# **EXHIBIT C:**

## **Media and Congressional Inquiries**

# **EXHIBIT**

**C.1.**

QUESTIONS FOR THE RECORD SUBMITTED BY

**THE HONORABLE DAVID PRICE**  
**Matthew T. Albence, Acting Director**  
**U.S. Immigration and Customs Enforcement**  
Committee on Appropriations  
Subcommittee on Homeland Security

*U.S. Immigration and Customs Enforcement Oversight Hearing*  
July 25, 2019

**Fees for Sanctuary Immigrants**

**Background:** On July 1, a 38-year-old mother of four taking sanctuary in the Church of Reconciliation in Chapel Hill receive a notice that ICE intends to fine her \$314,007 for “willfully failing or refusing” to leave the United States and for having “connived or conspired” to avoid deportation. This amounts to \$799 a day for each day that she has been in sanctuary. She is one of “fewer than ten” undocumented immigrants living in sanctuary who received a notice of intention to fine for an outrageously high sum that they can’t possibly pay. It is my understanding that the financial penalties for violating immigration laws have existed since 1996, but in the very rare instances where fines have been noticed, it has been for a total of about \$1,000.

**Questions (24 – 27):**

**24) Can you please explain why ICE has decided to start using these financial penalties?**

(b)(5)

(b)(5)

**25) How did ICE determine the arbitrary “\$799 a day,” when the 1996 law explicitly states that the immigrant could pay a civil penalty of “not more than \$500 for each day?”**

(b)(5)

**26) Why did it take over a year to identify fines for these individuals?**

(b)(5)

**27) Fewer than 10 immigrants received these letters, when we know of at least 50 immigrants in sanctuary in churches across the country. How is ICE determining which immigrants to fine?**

(b)(5)

# **EXHIBIT**

**C.2.**

**From:**

(b)(6); (b)(7)(C)

**Sent:**

17 Sep 2019 14:51:09 +0000

**To:**

Short, Tracy; Davis, Mike P; Davidson, Michael J (b)(6); (b)(7)(C)

(b)(6); (b)(7)(C)

**Subject:** FOR SES APPROVAL-109247 QFRs 24-27 - ICE Oversight Hearing / Fees for Sanctuary Immigration

**Attachments:** 109247\_QFRs 24 - 27 - Fees for Sanctuary Immigrants ERO 9-11 Final.docx

Good morning, SES Team:

**This task is due at 12:00PM today, and SES approval is required.**

Background

OPLA was asked to review the attached QFR responses regarding fees and penalties for sanctuary seekers subject to orders of removal.

(b)(5)

Recommended Closing

(b)(5); (b)(6); (b)(7)(C)

(b)(6); (b)(7)(C)

Chief, Executive Communications Unit  
Office of the Principal Legal Advisor  
U.S. Immigration and Customs Enforcement  
U.S. Department of Homeland Security  
500 12th Street SW, Room (b)(6); (b)(7)(C)  
Washington, DC 20536  
Office: (b)(6); (b)(7)(C)  
Mobile (b)(6); (b)(7)(C)



**U.S. Immigration  
and Customs  
Enforcement**

**\*\* Warning \*\*\* Attorney/Client Privilege \*\*\* Attorney Work Product \*\*\***

This communication and any attachments may contain confidential and/or sensitive attorney/client privileged information or attorney work product and/or law enforcement sensitive information. It is not for release, review, retransmission, dissemination, or use by anyone other than the intended recipient. Please notify the sender if this email has been misdirected and immediately destroy all originals and copies. Furthermore do not print, copy, re-transmit, disseminate, or otherwise use this information. Any disclosure of this communication or its attachments must be approved by the Office of the Principal Legal Advisor, U.S. Immigration and Customs Enforcement. This document is for INTERNAL GOVERNMENT USE ONLY and may be exempt from disclosure under the Freedom of Information Act, 5 USC §§ 552(b)(5), (b)(7).

---

**From:** ICATT.Alert (b)(6); (b)(7)(C)  
**Sent:** Monday, September 16, 2019 9:48 AM  
**To:** OPLA Tasking (b)(6); (b)(7)(C)  
**Subject:** Review and Comment -P-109247-QFRS 24-27 Fees for Sanctuary Immigration ICATT:0045716

Hello OPLA,

A Clearance has been assigned to you. Please accept in 1 day

Clearance Name: CL-QFR-P-109247 Assigned To OPLA

Due Date: 09/17/2019 12:00 PM Eastern

Instructions:

Please review and clear

Thank you.

# **EXHIBIT**

**C.3.**



Page 5621

Withheld pursuant to exemption

(b)(5)

of the Freedom of Information and Privacy Act

Page 5622

Withheld pursuant to exemption

(b)(5)

of the Freedom of Information and Privacy Act

# **EXHIBIT**

**C.4.**

**From:** Rocha, Richard A  
**To:** (b)(6); (b)(7)(C)  
**Subject:** RE: Civil Fines  
**Date:** Thursday, October 31, 2019 12:45:11 PM

---

H (b)(6); (b)(7)(C)

I called you back again. Tag. You're it

Thank you for helping me with this .. I'm on the hook to draft a release for these new fines (hopefully by the end of the day).

(b)(5)

Thank you,  
Richard Rocha  
Spokesperson  
U.S. Immigration and Customs Enforcement

(b)(6); (b)(7)(C)

---

**From:** Rocha, Richard A  
**Sent:** Thursday, October 31, 2019 9:54 AM  
**To:** (b)(6); (b)(7)(C)  
**Subject:** FW: Civil Fines

Hey (b)(6); (b)(7)(C)

Word on the street is that you're the man I can talk to about fines.. you cool if I call you in a bit? What's the best number ?

Thanks,  
Rich

Sent with BlackBerry Work  
([www.blackberry.com](http://www.blackberry.com))

---

**From:** Robbins, Timothy S (b)(6); (b)(7)(C)  
**Date:** Thursday, Oct 31, 2019, 9:00 AM  
**To:** Rocha, Richard A (b)(6); (b)(7)(C)  
**Cc:** Lucero, Enrique M (b)(6); (b)(7)(C); Cox, Bryan D (b)(6); (b)(7)(C)  
**Subject:** RE: Civil Fines

(b)(6);  
(b)(7)(C) could be

Sent with BlackBerry Work  
([www.blackberry.com](http://www.blackberry.com))

---

**From:** Rocha, Richard A <(b)(6); (b)(7)(C)>  
**Date:** Thursday, Oct 31, 2019, 6:46 AM  
**To:** (b)(6); (b)(7)(C)  
**Cc:** Lucero, Enrique M <(b)(6); (b)(7)(C)>, Robbins, Timothy S  
(b)(6); (b)(7)(C) Cox, Bryan D <(b)(6); (b)(7)(C)>  
**Subject:** FW: Civil Fines

Hi Matt,

Since it looks like (b)(6) is out, who is the best person to work with regarding fines. (b)(5)  
(b)(5)  
(b)(5) Is that  
what you all are thinking? (b)(5)

Thank you,  
Richard Rocha  
Spokesperson  
U.S. Immigration and Customs Enforcement

(b)(6); (b)(7)(C)

---

**From:** Cox, Bryan D <(b)(6); (b)(7)(C)>  
**Sent:** Thursday, October 31, 2019 8:32 AM  
**To:** Robbins, Timothy S <(b)(6); (b)(7)(C)>  
(b)(6); (b)(7)(C) Albence, Matthew <(b)(6); (b)(7)(C)>; Benner,  
Derek N <(b)(6); (b)(7)(C)> Rocha, Richard A <(b)(6); (b)(7)(C)>  
**Cc:** Lucero, Enrique M <(b)(6); (b)(7)(C)> Pallas, Charissa M  
(b)(6); (b)(7)(C)  
**Subject:** RE: Civil Fines

+Richard Rocha. Rich, (b)(5)  
(b)(5) Thanks all.

Bryan D. Cox  
Press Secretary (Acting)  
U.S. Immigration and Customs Enforcement

(b)(6); (b)(7)(C)

---

**From:** Robbins, Timothy S <(b)(6); (b)(7)(C)>  
**Sent:** Wednesday, October 30, 2019 4:35 PM  
**To:** (b)(6); (b)(7)(C); Albence, Matthew  
(b)(6); (b)(7)(C); Benner, Derek N <(b)(6); (b)(7)(C)>  
**Cc:** Lucero, Enrique M <(b)(6); (b)(7)(C)>; Cox, Bryan D <(b)(6); (b)(7)(C)>  
Pallas, Charissa M <(b)(6); (b)(7)(C)>  
**Subject:** RE: Civil Fines

Absolutely

Sent with BlackBerry Work  
([www.blackberry.com](http://www.blackberry.com))

---

**From:** (b)(6); (b)(7)(C)  
**Date:** Wednesday, Oct 30, 2019, 4:33 PM  
**To:** Robbins, Timothy S <(b)(6); (b)(7)(C)> Albence, Matthew  
(b)(6); (b)(7)(C); Benner, Derek N <(b)(6); (b)(7)(C)>  
**Cc:** Lucero, Enrique M <(b)(6); (b)(7)(C)> Cox, Bryan D <(b)(6); (b)(7)(C)> Pallas,  
Charissa M <(b)(6); (b)(7)(C)>  
**Subject:** RE: Civil Fines

Thanks, Tim.

(b)(5) Can (b)(6) work with Charissa and Bryan on that, please?

Sent with BlackBerry Work  
([www.blackberry.com](http://www.blackberry.com))

---

**From:** Robbins, Timothy S <(b)(6); (b)(7)(C)>  
**Date:** Wednesday, Oct 30, 2019, 4:32 PM  
**To:** Albence, Matthew <(b)(6); (b)(7)(C)> Benner, Derek N <(b)(6); (b)(7)(C)>  
**Cc:** Lucero, Enrique M <(b)(6); (b)(7)(C)>  
(b)(6); (b)(7)(C)  
**Subject:** FW: Civil Fines

Matt, the latest on fines...made some good progress over the last week.

Sent with BlackBerry Work  
([www.blackberry.com](http://www.blackberry.com))

# **EXHIBIT**

**C.5.**

Page 5711

Withheld pursuant to exemption

(b)(5)

of the Freedom of Information and Privacy Act



Page 5712

Withheld pursuant to exemption

(b)(5)

of the Freedom of Information and Privacy Act

# **EXHIBIT**

**C.6.**

Page 5687

Withheld pursuant to exemption

(b)(5)

of the Freedom of Information and Privacy Act

Page 5688

Withheld pursuant to exemption

(b)(5)

of the Freedom of Information and Privacy Act

# **EXHIBIT**

**C.7.**

(b)(5)

# **EXHIBIT**

**C.8.**

Page 5403

Withheld pursuant to exemption

(b)(5) ; (b)(6) ; (b)(7)(C)

of the Freedom of Information and Privacy Act



Page 5404

Withheld pursuant to exemption

(b)(5) ; (b)(6) ; (b)(7)(C)

of the Freedom of Information and Privacy Act

Page 5405

Withheld pursuant to exemption

(b)(5)

of the Freedom of Information and Privacy Act

# **EXHIBIT**

**C.9.**

**From:** (b)(6); (b)(7)(C)  
**Sent:** 16 Apr 2020 11:58:40 +0000  
**To:** ERO-FOIA  
**Subject:** FW: Messaging/Info for fine interview  
**Attachments:** Lucero notes for NIF interview.docx

**From:** Rocha, Richard A (b)(6); (b)(7)(C)

**Date:** Friday, Dec 06, 2019, 1:33 PM

**To:** Lucero, Enrique M (b)(6); (b)(7)(C)

(b)(6); (b)(7)(C)

**Subject:** Messaging/Info for fine interview

Hi Henry,

Here is the go-by for the interview today.. Let's chat about it prior to our call with the reporter.

(b)(5)

Thank you,  
Richard Rocha  
Spokesperson  
U.S. Immigration and Customs Enforcement  
202-407-(b)(6); (b)(7)(C) cell

(b)(6); (b)(7)(C)